

Internet Printing Protocol Workgroup Meeting Minutes November 4, 2015

Meeting was called to order at approximately 9:00am ET November 4, 2015.

Attendees

Gyaneshwar Gupta (OKI)
Smith Kennedy (HP)
Ira McDonald (High North)
Ole Skov (MPI Tech)
Mike Sweet (Apple)
William Wagner (TIC)
Craig Whittle (Sharp)
Rick Yardumian (Canon)

Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
 - IP policy accepted, Mike taking minutes
2. Slides:
 - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/slides/ipp-wg-agenda-november-15.pdf>
 -
3. Review of IPP/1.1
 - <http://tools.ietf.org/html/draft-sweet-rfc2911bis>
 - Section 1.1: Replace "OPTIONAL" with "IPP" from "The OPTIONAL notification service"
 - Section 2.2: Add reference to 5100.5 for Document definition
 - Section 2.3:
 - Definition of Set: "Finishing processes operate on Sets" (not operated)
 - Add definition of Job Creation (Print-Job, Print-URI, Create-Job operations, etc.) - anything that creates Job object
 - Section 3.2?
 - In summary, "although its use BY CLIENTS is DEPRECATED".
 - Section 4
 - "When a Client communicates with an IPP Server, the Client issues an operation request to the Printer URI and object's numeric identifier, if needed."
 - Section 4.1.2:
 - "However, in other TRANSPORT mapping the operation response COULD come back ..."
 - Global: "mal-formed" to "malformed"
 - Check whether we say all operations are required or optional? (add recommended, and deprecated)

- Section 4.1.6.2: Review second paragraph
- Section 4.1.6.3:
 - "for human consumption and intended for use by more technical persons" - make clear
 - Reword OPTIONAL bit: "SHOULD localized, however localization can obscure ..."
- Section 4.1.7:
 - "for an example" => "for examples."
- Section 4.1.8:
 - Fix "Appendix E (see Appendix E)
- Section 4.1.9:
 - "followed by ZERO OR MORE Send-Document ..."
 - Drop "There are validation checks"?
 - Make Job Submission Validation and Job Processing Validation subsections?
- Section 4.2.1.1 (Print-Job Request)
 - "document-natural-language" -> "The value specifies the natural language of the Document CONTENT ..."
 - "natural language to properly image the Document." at end
 - Reword: "In addition to the REQUIRED parameters for every ..."
- Section 4.2.1.2 (Print-Job Response)
 - Drop everything but first sentence for "job-uri"
 - "no ADDITIONAL Printer Status attributes"
 - Reword: "In addition to the REQUIRED parameters for every ..."
- Section 4.2.2 (Print-URI)
 - "If the Printer DISCOVERS an accessibility, ..., it MUST reject the request and return the..."
- Section 4.? .1 (Get-Printer-Attributes)
 - "attribure" -> "attribute"
- Section 4.2.7 (Pause-Printer)
 - No colon after "shown in Table 2:" (period instead)
- Section 4.2.9 (Purge-Jobs)
 - "If THIS OPERATION is supported, the Printer ..."
- Section 4.3.1:
 - Reword first sentence so it is clear that Create-Job created the Job
- Section 4.3.1.1:
 - Copy document-natural-changes from Print-Job request
- Section 4.3.3:
 - Merge last two paragraphs ("Otherwise" refers to access rights)
- Global: "See Rule N" -> (Note N) in tables, Note N below (instead of Rule N)
- Global: "OPTION N" -> (Option N) with option below, or "Option N" inline
- Section 5.1.4 ('enum')
 - "Note: SOME SNMP MIBs use '2' for ..."
- Section 5.2:
 - "... Printers SHOULD support Job Template attributes."
 - Table 8: "Printer: Supported Values ..." heading is messed up

- Section 5.2.1:
 - Fix examples at end to show mapping - separate examples.
- Global: Fix all Sections <letter> and <number>
- Section 5.2.6:
 - Missing period after "listed in Table 9".
 - "Note: The value of '3' ('none') has no effect when combined with any other values."
- Section 5.2.7:
 - Third paragraph: capitalize Document
 - "Job Template ATTRIBUTE is ..."
- Section 5.2.11:
 - Reword: "However, the Client SHOULD only use the media attribute for specifying medium-sizes using ..."
 - "Historical keyword" => "Legacy keyword"
- Section 5.2.12:
 - "that THE Printer uses "
- Section 5.2.13:
 - Move note above table.
- Section 5.3:
 - Table 13: fix order of job-state in table
- Section 5.3.1:
 - Move job-uri after job-id
- Section 5.3.7.1:
 - Add RFC 3998 reference for fan-in/fan-out.
 - "give the end user the wrong Impression" should be "confuse the end user about the state..."
- Section 5.3.x (job-state-reasons)
 - Fix "service-offline" should be "service-off-line"
- Global: Fix 'job-state-reasons', use double quotes ("job-state-reasons")
- Section 5.3.10:
 - Copy changes from section 4.1.6.3
- Section 5.3.12:
 - Drop "or not" from the end of the first paragraph.
- Global: Use Output Device instead of output device, sync definition with IPP INFRA
- Global: Investigate Terminating State term/definition for jobs
- Section 5.3.27.1;
 - Document(s)
 - "This value also MUST NOT include ..."
- Section 5.3.17.2:
 - Document(s)
 - "This value also MUST NOT include ..."
- Section 5.3.17.3: This RECOMMENDED attribute...
- Section 5.3.18:
 - "That is, the VALUES for a Job ..."
- Section 5.3.18.3:
 - "This RECOMMENDED attribute ..."

- Section 5.4.1:
 - "This REQUIRED Printer attribute contains one or more URIs for the Printer."
 - Add boilerplate about "i th" value stuff
- Section 5.4.3:
 - Drop "It is expected that many", maybe "Some Printer will be configured..."
- Section 5.4.12:
 - Add references to Printer MIB for suffixes, IANA IPP registry for keywords.
- Stopped at section 5.4.28
- 4. Review of IPP Everywhere Printer Self-Certification
 - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippeveselfcert10-20151009-rev.pdf>
 - Bug in submission form: accepted without files and with bogus files
 - Q: What about exceptions?
 - A: New process is to have the submitter report the issue to the ippeveselfcert@pwg.org mailing list or via the Github issues page; then we can resolve it either in the tools or ignore the failed tests in the web site submission form
 - Q: What to do about software updates independent of Manual updates?
 - A: Use the same document version (10, 11, 12, etc.) but use the release date as part of the tool version so you know that the latest date is the most recent tool release
 - Need to separate test file versions from software versions (used to match to a specific release of the tests in the manual)
 - Q: Does PWG Last Call apply to just the manual?
 - A: No, to the manual, beta web site, and tools
 - Section 1.3:
 - Add Github issues page for problems in the tools.
 - Mention reporting test issues for exceptions here as well.
 - Global: PWG Member
 - Section 2.x:
 - Add PWG Member term with reference to members page
 - Page 26, add screenshot for Figure 4
 - Action: Mike to post updated tools, web site, and stable draft of manual
 - Action: Bring IPP Everywhere Printer Self-Certification Manual to Steering Committee to start PWG Last Call
- 5. Review IPP System Service
 - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippssystem10-20151102-rev.pdf>
 - Did not get to this.

Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next conference calls November 16 and December 7, 2015 at 3pm ET
- Start PWG Last Call of Self-Cert before next IPP WG conference call
- Prepare updated IPP WG charter with new 3D work for next conference call

- Continue review of RFC2910bis and RFC2911bis
- Continue discussion and scoping of System Service operations and attributes
- Action: Mike to post updated tools, web site, and stable draft of manual
- Action: Bring IPP Everywhere Printer Self-Certification Manual to Steering Committee to start PWG Last Call
- Action: Mike to post IPP F2F slides to list for discussion (DONE)
- Action: Mike to post updated hash registration including 512/224 variants (DONE)
- Action: Mike to start WG Last Call of Self-Cert and ISTO Review (DONE)
- Action: Everyone to post their list of user operations for the system service to the IPP WG list (PENDING - finalize discussion at F2F)