Internet Printing Protocol Meeting Minutes
January 5, 2023

Meeting was called to order at 3pm EST on January 5, 2023.

Attendees

Smith Kennedy (HP)
Jeremy Leber (Lexmark)
Ira McDonald (High North)
Chris Rizzo (Xerox)
Anthony Suarez (Kyocera)
Michael Sweet (Lakeside Robotics)
Bill Wagner (TIC)
Uli Wehner (Ricoh)
Steven Young (Canon)

Agenda Items

1. Antitrust and IP policies, minute taker
   - https://www.pwg.org/chair/membership_docs/pwg-ip-policy.pdf
   - https://www.pwg.org/chair/membership_docs/pwg-antitrust-policy.pdf
   - Antitrust and IP policies accepted, Mike taking minutes
2. IPP minutes from previous meetings
   - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-concall-minutes-20221205.pdf
   - Approved as posted
3. Status/Review of various IPP mailing list notes
   - https://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2023/021348.html
     - Fwd: [CFRG] I-D Action: draft-irtf-cfrg-aead-properties-00.txt (Ira)
     - Clarify each potentially present and specifically useful AEAD crypto algorithm property
4. Status of AMSC and ISO liaisons w/ PWG (Paul)
   - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/sc/pwg-sc-call-minutes-20221031.htm
   - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/sc/pwg-sc-call-minutes-20221128.htm
   - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/general/sc/pwg-sc-call-minutes-20221212.htm
   - See PWG Steering Committee minutes from 10/31/22, 11/28/22, 12/12/22
5. Status of PWG and IPP WG Formal Approvals and Last Calls (All)
   - IPP Production Printing Extensions v2.0 - status (Mike)
     - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippppx20-20221212-rev.pdf
     - https://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2022/021336.html
     - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/lcrc-ippppx20.txt
     - Stable draft - for a Candidate Standard
     - PWG Last Call started on 10/11/22 and ended on 11/11/22
       - Quorum achieved (30 members x 30% = 9 / 10 responses)

- PWG Formal Approval started on 01/04/23 and ends on 01/31/23
    - Quorum requires 7 votes (29 voting members x 25%)
- Schedule - PWG Candidate Standard in Q1 2023
- IPP Job Extensions v2.1 - status (Mike)
    - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippjobext21-20221212-rev.pdf
    - https://www.pwg.org/archives/ipp/2022/021337.html
    - Stable draft - for a Candidate Standard
    - IPP WG Last Call started on 11/24/22 and ended on 12/08/22
    - Feedback from Benjamin Gordon on 12/06/22
    - Schedule - PWG Call for Objections in Q1 2023
    - Action: Mike to start JOBEXT Call for Objections from Jan 9 to Feb 10, 2023
- IPP Driver Replacement Extensions v2.0 - status (Smith/Mike)
    - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippnodriver20-20221027.pdf
    - Stable draft - for a Candidate Standard
    - New document name in recent drafts (for clarity)
    - PWG F2F review on 16 November 2022
    - PWG Last Call started on 10/31/22 and ends on 01/05
    - Quorum achieved (30 members x 30% = 9 / 10 responses)
    - Schedule - PWG Formal Approval Q1 2023
    - Action: Smith to post an LCRC draft of NODRIVER before the Jan 19 concall
6. OAuth2 (Mike, Smith, Piotr, Benjamin)
    - https://github.com/istopwg/ippsample/wiki/IPP-and-OAuth
    - PWG F2F discussion on 12/08/22
    - More discussion today on resources, attestation, trustworthiness?
    - Smith/HP JWE resource identifier proposal:
        - https://www.pwg.org/pipermail/ipp/2023/021350.html
        - Mike: JWE validation uses public key from AA, so step 8 is 8.1 get public key and 8.2 validate JWE on the client
        - Mike: Still depends on X.509 cert validation to establish basic trust
        - Smith: We still need local X.509 certs that can be trusted
        - Mike: See diagrams from November 2022 F2F, probably need both high level "entity" diagrams (the "what") and the data flow diagrams showing the "how"
            - https://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/slides/ipp-wg-agenda-november-22.pdf#page=27
    - Action: Smith to provide OAuth updates from HP
    - Piotr is working on an update to his RAR white paper
    - Ira: Have concerns about using JSON Web Tokens directly in IPP since IETF is standardizing on CBOR web tokens (CWT) for RATS, etc.
        - Smith: OAuth is agnostic but OIDC/OpenID uses JWT
        - Semantics of CBOR web token values can be preserved when converted to/from JSON web tokens, but CBOR sub-type information won't be preserved
        - Look at RATS work for inspiration for our RAR work

- Mike: RAR still "wild west" but we can follow the RATS data model/claims. RAR requests are not authenticated/signed/encrypted but response tokens *are*...
    - Ira: RARS imports existing IANA registries for data model whenever possible
- Ira: Would be good to add IETF RATS, SUIT, and TEEP to HCD best practices document

Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next conference calls on January 19 and February 2, 2023 at 3pm
- Action: Mike to start JOBEXT Call for Objections from Jan 9 to Feb 10, 2023
- Action: Smith to post an LCRC draft of NODRIVER before the Jan 19 concall
- Action: Smith to provide OAuth updates from HP
- Action: Mike to add an errata issue about job-processing-time for Job Accounting BP (PENDING, no mechanism)
- Action: Mike to update template to include Printer Conformance and boldface value examples for list paragraph (DONE)
- Action: Mike to start PWG Formal Vote of PPX starting on Jan 3, ending Jan 31, 2023 (DONE)