

# Internet Printing Protocol Workgroup Meeting Minutes

## May 9, 2016

Meeting was called to order at approximately 3:00pm ET on May 9, 2016.

### Attendees

Smith Kennedy (HP)  
Daniel Manchala (Xerox)  
Ira McDonald (High North)  
Michael Sweet (Apple)  
Paul Tykodi (TCS)  
William Wagner (TIC)  
Rick Yardumian (Canon)

### Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
  - IP policy accepted, Mike taking minutes
2. Review previous minutes:
  - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-concall-minutes-20160411.pdf>
  - Approved as posted
  - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-f2f-minutes-20160427.pdf>
  - Q: What status code to return when "document-format" and "document-format-details" conflict?
    - A: client-error-conflicting-attributes if document-format doesn't match document-format-details.document-format and document-format isn't an archive format
    - Could also return successful-ok-ignored-or-substituted-attributes
    - PWG 5100.5 leaves the choice to the implementation...
  - Q: What if Client supplies wrong document-format (e.g. PCL for PDF document)
    - A: client-error-document-format-error or detection after the fact with aborted job, or lots of random text printed out...
  - Approved as posted
3. Status of various IPP documents (Ira/Mike/Smith)
  - IETF IPP/1.1 Updates (Mike/Ira)
    - <http://www.ietf.org/internet-drafts/draft-sweet-rfc2910bis-07.txt>
    - <http://www.ietf.org/internet-drafts/draft-sweet-rfc2911bis-09.txt>
    - Changes for new IETF Proposed Standard
    - Barry Leiba (IETF ART AD) will be AD sponsor - note on 07/12/15
    - 2910bis and 2911bis reviewed by PWG F2F on 04/26/16
    - Consensus is to submit to Barry Leiba at IETF for review
    - Mike to fix double references to pwg.org

- Ira to send RFC 2910bis and 2911bis to IETF for review
  - Schedule - IETF Last Call in Q3/Q4 2016
  - IPP Everywhere Printer Self-Certification
    - Action: Smith to send IPP Everywhere self-cert reminder to pwg-announce list
    - Q: page-overrides: should document-numbers be required?
      - <http://www.pwg.org/pipermail/ipp/2016/018779.html>
      - Can we soften the requirement to support document-numbers, e.g. Printer MUST silently ignore document-numbers if not supported?
      - Errata for PWG 5100.14:
        - Table 6 (printer attributes) expand on overrides-supported, or add subsection
        - Table 8 (job template attributes) expand overrides member attributes (pages + any job template attribute)
      - Issue for self-cert tools:
        - Do not require document-numbers in overrides-supported
        - Action: Mike to update submission page to allow failure of document-numbers test
    - Q: Delay self-cert for updated tools and resolution of document-numbers issue?
      - A: No, let people know about known issues but press on...
  - IPP 3D Printing Extensions (Mike)
    - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ipp3d10-20160430-rev.pdf>
    - Reviewed by PWG F2F on 04/27/16
    - Schedule - PWG Last Call in Q3/Q4 2016
    - Delay next conference call to June 6 to provide time for prototyping.
    - Action: Mike to post reminder to prototype IPP 3D and provide feedback before June 6th meeting
  - IPP Finishings 2.1 (Smith)
    - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippfinishings21-20160418.pdf>
    - Reviewed by PWG F2F on 04/27/16
    - Schedule - PWG Call for Objections in Q3/Q4 2016
4. Proposals from April PWG F2F (All)
- HP Media Sizes
    - Accepted - Mike to post registration template for HP media sizes
  - Canon Multi-Hole Punch
    - Rejected - "punching-number"
    - Accepted - Mike to post registration template for Canon 'punch-multiple-xxx' values
  - Canon Job Account Password
    - Rejected - but leave open for future white paper
  - HP Staple vs. Media Feed Orientation
    - <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/slides/Finishings-2.1-Orientation-and-Feed-Orientation-Extensions.pdf>

- Deferred to today's conference call
  - Slide 2: Q: Are documents printed on pre-folded sheets?
    - A: Copied from 3.2.15 use case, re-word "first impose input pages onto sheets, then staple, ..." (not "folded sheets")
  - Q: Report media-source in finishings-col-ready (for media-col-ready sources) and use media-needed to handle cases where the media needs to be loaded differently?
    - A: Needs further discussion
  - media-source vs. media-source-feed-orientation - media-source is most useful for loaded (ready) media, media-source-feed-orientation is most useful for general capabilities
  - orientation-requested could be used to swap corners (e.g. top-left vs. bottom-right, etc.)
  - Smith will expand on the examples in the slide deck and we will discuss more at the next conference call
  - Need to balance Client and Printer requirements/use cases, avoid large finishings-col-database/ready values, etc.
5. IPP System Service
- <http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippssystem10-20160509-rev.pdf>
  - Interim draft
  - Reviewed by PWG F2F on 04/26/16
  - Still need to add printer-config-changes - oops!
  - Still need to fix reference to PWG 5100.12 - oops!
  - Schedule - Prototype draft in Q3/Q4 2016
  - Line 642 (Note 6 on Table 1): 'equivalent' -> 'analogous to the "printer-settable-attributes-supported" Printer Description attribute ..'
  - Table 2:
    - system-state-change-date/time should be "<none>[8]" for SM Element Name
    - Notes 7 and 9: Expand 5100.13 reference with full spec name "IPP Job and Printer Extensions - Set 3 (JPS3)"
  - Line 697 (Note 7 or Table 3): 'equivalent' -> 'analogous'
  - Table 6:
    - "printer-owner-col" instead of "printer-owner"
    - Add "printer-config-changes"
  - Section 6.2:
    - Line 801: "associated by and configured services" (drop "and")
    - Line 802: Missing hyphen between "print" and "color-mode-supported"
    - Add quotes around attribute names.
  - Section 6.14:
    - Get-xxx-Settable-Values should be Get-xxx-Supported-Values
  - Section 7.2:
    - Line 1394: Drop "All of the" from front.
    - Line 1395: Drop "be" after "potentially".
    - Line 1396: "Writable System Description attributes are listed in the ..."

- Section 7.2.7.4:
  - Consider dropping "the first day of the week" and just saying Sunday.
  - Delete list of keyword values
- Stopped at 7.3

## Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next IPP conference calls May 23, 2016 at 3pm ET and June 6, 2016 at 4pm ET (3D)
- Action: Smith to send IPP Everywhere self-cert reminder to pwg-announce list
- Action: Mike to update submission page to allow failure of document-numbers test
- Action: Mike to post reminder to prototype IPP 3D and provide feedback before June 6th meeting
- Action: Ira to send RFC 2910bis and 2911bis to IETF for review (PENDING - Sending to Barry)
- Action: Mike to post registration template for HP media sizes (PENDING)
- Action: Mike to post registration template for Canon 'punch-multiple-xxx' values (PENDING)
- Action: Smith to ask Mike for status on the printers list, and how notification works when submissions have been made and/or new printers are added to the list (DONE - just waiting for a submission)
- Action: Mike to update 2911bis to say "SHOULD NOT return 'successful-ok-ignored-or-substituted-attributes' when there are attributes whose values should be identical but are not, and SHOULD instead return 'client-error-attributes-or-values-not-supported' or something similarly appropriate, and generally SHOULD NOT return any of the 'successful-ok-XXX' ..." (DONE - needs errata reported for PWG 5100.1, 5100.3, and 5100.5)
- Action: Mike to post updated WD template with boilerplate "operating system providers" fixed (PENDING)