Internet Printing Protocol WG Minutes
December 8, 2014

Meeting was called to order at approximately 3:00pm ET December 8, 2014

Attendees

Smith Kennedy (HP)
Ira McDonald (High North)
Mike Sweet (Apple)
Paul Tykodi (TCS)
Bill Wagner (TIC)
Rick Yardumian (Canon)

Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
   a. Policy accepted with Mike taking the minutes
2. Review previous minutes:
   a. http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/minutes/ippv2-concall-minutes-20141117.pdf
   c. Approved as posted
3. Status of various IPP documents (Ira/Mike)
   a. IETF IPP over HTTPS Binding and 'ipps' URI Scheme (Ira)
      - http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/draft-mcdonald-ipps-uri-scheme-16-20141111.pdf
      - Stable draft - updated per Tom Petch, Graham Klyne, and Barry Leiba
      - IESG Approved on 4 December 2014 (minor editorial revisions pending)
      - Schedule - TBD per RFC Editor
   b. IETF LDAP Printer Schema (Ira)
      - http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/draft-mcdonald-ldap-printer-schema-09-20140928.pdf
      - Stable draft - sent to RFC Editor Independent Stream per Barry Leiba (IETF Apps AD)
      - Sent to RFC Editor Independent Stream per Barry Leiba (IETF Apps AD)
      - Schedule - TBD per RFC Editor
   c. IPP Everywhere Printer Self-Certification (SELFCERT) (Mike)
      - http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippeveselfcert10-20140826-rev.pdf
      - Prototype draft - waiting for prototype and beta test reports
      - Reviewed by IPP WG on 08/25
      - Beta tools released on 08/28 (OS X/Linux) and 09/02 (Windows)

- Schedule - PWG Last Call Q1 2015
  d. IPP Shared Infrastructure Extensions (INFRA) (Mike)
    - http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippinfra10-20141118-rev.pdf
    - Stable draft - prototype report on 11/4
    - IPP WG last call ended on 12/05 with no comments
    - Schedule - PWG Last Call Q4 2014
    - Action: Mike to post PWG Last Call of IPP INFRA to span February 2015 F2F
    - Action: Mike to send Ira description and examples of Register-System operation
  e. IPP Finishings 2.0 (FIN) (Mike)
    - http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippfinishings20-20141117-rev.pdf
    - Stable draft - prototype report on 6/19
    - PWG Formal Vote (started 11/17, ends 12/19)
4. Review of IPP Implementor's Guide v2.0 (IG) (Smith)
  a. http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ig-20141113-rev.pdf
  b. Prototoype draft - prototype report on 12/8
  c. Reviewed at PWG F2F in August
  d. Filename should be "wd-ippig20-yyyymmdd.ext"
  e. Conformance terminology:
    - Only use SHOULD or SHOULD NOT for recommendations
    - Do not use MUST or MUST NOT - those are for the base specs
    - Make sure that Client and Printer conformance is separate
  f. Resumed at section 8.2
  g. Add section 4.12 on error handling:
    - Say something about error reporting: An action taken by a Client that includes informing the User and/or logging the condition, e.g., PWG Common Log Format [PWG5110.3].
    - Add SHOULD use PWG Common Log Format for Client and Server
    - Add normative reference to PWG 5110.3
  h. Section 8.2:
    - Reword last sentence: Allows the server to tell the client it needs to upgrade or authenticate prior to processing the request.
  i. Section 8.2.1:
    - Line 1955: "at least 1 second" instead of "up to 1 second"
    - Line 1957: Drop section reference in RFC 7230
    - Bullet 1: make as a separate paragraph, move last sentence of previous paragraph to restart the list
    - Line 1959: "no further response delays are incurred" instead of "no further 1-second delays"; "record" instead of "remember"
    - Line 1966-1969: Don't bother talking about downgrades. "If the request type is HEAD or GET, redirect the request to the new URI or address the redirection in an implementation-defined way, e.g., request confirmation from the User, validate the redirected URI scheme and origin server, etc.
    - Line 1969-1970: If an HTTP 400 Bad Request status code is

> received, the Client should record the lack of Expect header support, reconnect to the server, ...
>   - "fail" -> "give up"?
>   - Maybe also provide a back reference to new section 4.12 on error handling
>   - Reference section 6.3 of RFC 7230 on connection persistence up front rather than talking explicitly about reconnecting
>   - Reference section 5.1.1 of RFC 7231 on Expect header
>   - Break out bullet 4 as an implementation note (non-conforming behavior), maybe include bullet pointing to the note because it is different from the other status codes.
>   - Sort status codes in numerical order
>   - Keep reference to RFC 2817, just drop "as described in"
>   - Lines 1983-1984: SHOULD treat this as a fatal error. (drop parenthetical statement)

- j. Section 8.2.2:
    - The HTTP server accepts and processes the Expect header as defined in section 5.1.1 of /title/ [RFC7231].
- k. Section 8.3:
    - "An HTTP Server validates the Host request header in order to protect against DNS rebinding attacks. Section ?? of IPP Everywhere [PWG5100.14] places additional requirements on the Host header."
- l. Section 8.4:
    - RFC 7232 talks about If-Modified-Since and Last-Modified - drop old section references.
    - RFC 7231 talks about status codes
    - MUST -> SHOULD
- m. Section 8.5:
    - MUST -> SHOULD
    - RFC 7234 instead of 7230, drop section reference
    - Last sentence: change to section reference to IPP Everywhere (which defines conformance requirements - see section 8.3 for example text)
- n. Global: Change "return" to "send" (as the server/printer) or "receive" (as the client)
- o. Global: Drop section references in RFC 723x
- p. Stopped before section 9
- q. Post updated prototype draft (one more prototype draft until we finish reviewing)

1. Review of IPP System Control Service (Mike/Ira)
   - a. http://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/wd/wd-ippsystem10-20141102-rev.pdf
   - b. Interim draft - resume review at section 4
   - c. Need to add Resource ops, Register/Deregister, Get-Printer-Attributes
   - d. Reviewed at PWG F2F in November
   - e. Schedule - Prototype draft in Q2 2015
   - f. Did not get to this.

Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next IPP conference call January 5 and January 19, 2015 at 3pm ET
- Review IPP Implementor's Guide 2.0
- Review IPP System Service
- Action: Mike to post PWG Last Call of IPP INFRA to span February 2015 F2F
- Action: Mike to send Ira description and examples of Register-System operation
- Action: Mike to post updated stable draft of INFRA and start WG Last Call ending Dec 5th (DONE)
- Action: Mike to post updated stable draft of FIN and start PWG Formal Vote ending Dec 19th (DONE)
- Action: Mike to post updated registration process per Oct 20 concall (ONGOING - try for next IPP concall)
- Action: Ira to add comments to Printer MIB TC in 5107.3 for fax-modem-protocol-error and xxx-recoverable-storage-error - suffix dropped from IPP keyword with corresponding suffix (-error, -report, -warning) added depending on the printer state. (PENDING - for update with the 5107.3 errata)
- Action: Ira to submit Printer MIB registration for new xxx-missing PrtAlertCodeTC values in 5107.3 (PENDING - for update with the 5107.3 errata)