

1 Concatenated mail messages on URL Scheme I-D

2  
3 From: Herriot, Robert [Robert.Herriot@pahv.xerox.com]

4 Sent: Monday, January 15, 2001 12:39

5 To: ipp@pwg.org

6 Subject: IPP> comments on

7 <http://www.ietf.org/internet-drafts/draft-ietf-ipp-url-scheme-00.txt>

8  
9 Here are a few minor comments about

10 <http://www.ietf.org/internet-drafts/draft-ietf-ipp-url-scheme-00.txt>

11  
12 Change "Xerox" and "Xerox Corp" to "Xerox Corporation"

13  
14 Section 5.2 a implies that an admin cannot configure a printer to accept  
15 jobs on port 80 and not on port 631. If this is our intention, we should  
16 explicitly state that a conforming IPP printer MUST NOT allow an  
17 administration to disable port 631 if other ports can accept IPP jobs. If  
18 this is not our intention, we should add the "unless explicitly configured  
19 by system administrators or site policies"

20  
21 Here is an issue that probably should be addressed in sections 4.1, 5.1 and  
22 5.2. The document contains no discussion of what the 'host' and 'path' mean  
23 in the context of a printer. The reader probably know what it means for an  
24 HTTP URL, but not what it means for a printer.

25  
26 We should probably say that a printer can be identified by a host or a host  
27 and a path, and that two printers with the same host but different paths are  
28 intended to be different printers. Here is some suggested text.

29  
30 The following are examples of URLs for IPP printers: "ipp://abc.com",  
31 "ipp://abc.com/printer",  
32 "ipp://abc.com/tiger", "ipp://abc.com/printers/tiger", "ipp://abc.com/printers  
33 /fox", "ipp://abc.com/printers/tiger/bob",  
34 "ipp://abc.com/printers/tiger/ira", "ipp://printer.abc.com",  
35 "ipp://printers.abc.com/tiger", "ipp://printers.abc.com/tiger/bob" and  
36 "ipp://printers.abc.com/tiger/ira".

37  
38 All of the above URLs are legitimate URLs for IPP printers. Each of these  
39 URLs references a printer which is logically different from the printers  
40 referenced by any of the other sample URLs, even though some may share the  
41 same hardware. The last part of the path "bob" or "ira" may represent two  
42 different hardware devices where "tiger" represents some grouping of  
43 printers or the two names may represent separate human recipients ("bob" and  
44 "ira") on the printer named "tiger". In either case both "bob" and "ira" act  
45 as different printers.

46  
47 Bob Herriot

48  
49  
50  
51  
52 -----Original Message-----

53 From: Herriot, Robert [mailto:Robert.Herriot@pahv.xerox.com]

54 Sent: Wednesday, January 17, 2001 15:38

55 To: ipp@pwg.org  
56 Subject: IPP> another comment on  
57 http://www.ietf.org/internet-drafts/draft-ietf-ipp-ur l-scheme-00.txt  
58  
59  
60 The draft needs to clarify that the scheme "ipp" applies only to the  
61 transport and encoding defined by RFC 2910 and successor documents. If the  
62 IPP model (RFC 2911) is the basis for some other transport (e.g. BEEP) or  
63 some other encoding (e.g. XML), a new scheme with a name other than "ipp"  
64 must be defined.  
65  
66 Bob Herriot  
67  
68  
69 From: Carl Kugler [kugler@us.ibm.com]  
70 Sent: Wednesday, January 17, 2001 10:11  
71 To: ipp@pwg.org  
72 Subject: RE: IPP> I-D ACTION:draft-ietf-ipp-url-scheme-00.txt[IIG]  
73  
74 What ever happened to the section about backward compatibility with  
75 IPP/1.0? It used to be in  
76  
77 ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ipp/new\_PRO/ipp-scheme-981116.doc  
78  
79  
80 -Carl  
81  
82 1 Compatibility with IPP/1.0  
83 For compatibility with IPP/1.0, clients and IPP objects (i.e. a server)  
84 MUST support additional schemes as described in this section:  
85  
86 . If a server receives an IPP/1.0 request, it MUST return an IPP/1.0  
87 response. That is, it MUST support an http-URL in the target "printer-uri"  
88 and "job-uri" operation attributes in a request. If the server returns any  
89 of the 3 attributes, "job-uri", "job-printer-uri" or  
90 "printer-uri-supported" in the response, the value of these attributes MUST  
91 be http-URLs. For security, a server MAY also support https-URLs.  
92 . When a server returns the printer attribute "printer-uri-supported",  
93 it MUST return all supported values for an IPP/NV request. For an IPP/1.0  
94 request, a server MUST NOT return values that are ipp-URLs, i.e. it MUST  
95 return only the http-URLs and https-URLs.  
96 . The table below shows the type of URL that a server returns for the  
97 "job-uri" and "job-printer-uri" job attributes for all operations based on  
98 how the job was created. The "or" in the table below indicates an  
99 implementation option.

Operation attributes for a request	Job created via
	ipphttphttps
ipp	ippippNo URL returned

109  
110  
111  
112  
113  
114  
115  
116  
117  
118  
119  
120  
121  
122  
123  
124  
125  
126  
127  
128  
129  
130  
131  
132

-----+-----	
http	httphttpNo URL returned
-----+-----	
https	https or httphttps or httphttps
-----+-----	

- If a server registers an ipp-URL with a name service, then it MUST also register an http-URL. If a printer supports a secure connection using SSL3, then it MUST register an https-URL.
- An IPP/NV client MUST use an ipp-URL for non-secure printers unless it receives a "version not supported" error message. Then it MUST try to send a request in version 1.0, using the http-URL in place of the ipp-URL for the target "job-uri" and "printer-uri" operation attributes in the request. For secure printers, an IPP/NV client must operate as an IPP/1.0 client and use an https-URL. An IPP/1.0 client MUST use an http-URL for non-secure printers and an https-URL for secure printers.