

# IDS Face-to-Face Minutes

## December 8, 2011

Meeting was called to order at approximately 1:15pm local December 8, 2011.

### Attendees

Jacob Brown (Dell)  
Ira McDonald (High North/Samsung - call in)  
Joe Murdock (Sharp)  
Glen Petrie (Epson - call in)  
Brian Smithson (Ricoh - call in)  
Michael Sweet (Apple)  
Jerry Thrasher (Lexmark)  
Randy Turner (Amalfi - call in)  
Bill Wagner (TIC)  
Rick Yardumian (Canon)

### Agenda Items

1. IP Policy and Minute Taker
  - a. Policy accepted with Mike taking the minutes
2. Approved the non-existent minutes from the previous concall
3. Action items
  - a. 117 (Brian Smithson): mark as completed, Brian posting copy during meeting
4. IDS Attributes
  - a. Code 1:
    - Change AttributesNaturalLanguage to just "NaturalLanguage"
    - Don't bind to NaturalLanguageConfigured, just provide an implementation note that it may come from that element, from the requested language (e.g. IPP), etc.
    - Also add notes about the dangers of changing the natural language when re-evaluating the status of a device (i.e. change control to German and everything comes back in German instead of English)
5. IDS-ATTR
  - a. <ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ids/wd/wd-idsattributes10-20111204.pdf>
  - b. Section 4.1: Explain "code" header as the decimal value assigned in the PWG registry for these attributes.
  - c. Global: add captions to all tables.
  - d. Figure out a way to list attributes (or groups of attributes) in the table of contents.
  - e. Add RFC 5646 normative reference for language tags
  - f. Make section 9 (References), 9.1 (Normative References), and 9.2 (Informative References)
  - g. DefaultPasswordEnabled: Clarify semantics to reflect that the value is false if ALL default passwords are disabled and true otherwise (in the case of multiple default passwords)
  - h. ForwardingEnabled: Sync up with IETF definition to reflect that the value is true if forwarding or bridging between ANY interface is enabled and false otherwise.
  - i. Add limits for string attribute lengths
    - Adopt IPP/SM limits as appropriate
    - Upper limit is 32767 for strings and 1023 for URIs in IPP
6. IDS-NAP
  - a. <ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ids/wd/wd-ids-napsoh10-20111204.pdf>
  - b. Fix conformance of UserApplicationEnabled/PersistenceEnabled: Should be mandatory
  - c. Style: "decimal (0xHEX)" or "0xHEX (decimal)"? Joe will check the NAP specs
    - Microsoft uses decimal for TLV indexes and hex for values
    - TNC uses "0xHEX (decimal)"
    - Source spec "rules" - stick with current style ("decimal (0xHEX)") for TLVs plus hex representations for all values
    - Ira will keep TNC binding consistent with TNC style
  - d. DefaultPasswordEnabled: make sure the semantics reflect that the value is false if ALL default passwords are disabled and true otherwise
  - e. Fix change history (search/replace change affected change log)

- f. Move section 6.2 someplace else (not in our conformance section)
7. TNC/NEA
- a. <ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ids/wd/wd-ids-tnc10-20111205-rev.pdf>
  - b. Action: Mike to change template abstract to use the word "document" instead of "standard".
  - c. Page 19: Need to document which (required) attributes need the NOSKIP flag set, such as "NaturalLanguage".
  - d. Section 5.1.1: Update name
  - e. Line 646: "the name of the manufacturer OF this device" (missing word)
  - f. Section 5.1.4:
    - Line 664: "decimal 12 plus 3 for the length of the attribute value"
    - Line 665-666: 24-bits, no padding
  - g. Issue: DefaultPasswordEnabled vs. TCG FactoryDefaultPasswordEnabled
    - Do we define our own in parallel or reference TCG property?
    - Using TCG will scatter some properties throughout the various types
    - Also may introduce additional requirements/dependencies to use the TCG properties
    - Consensus is to simply reference TCG properties (SHOULD be consistent with TCG ...) and still have our own copy
  - h. Section 5/5.1: Add some notes about the coding decisions that follow style from TCG (e.g. booleans are 32-bits, variable-length strings, etc.)
  - i. Add note to be careful about protocol mapping of firewall rules (e.g. to SM)
  - j. Section 5.1.9: Say "from oldest to newest" in description on 752-753, just like for the value description.
  - k. FirmwarePatches:
    - Isn't there a TCG property?
    - How to represent multiple values and/or extend a value?
    - If a single value, define encoding/escaping since the abstract attribute is an array of values
    - Similar issues for application attributes
  - l. Line 799: "must BE deleted" (missing word)
8. IDS-IAA
- a. <ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ids/wd/schema/12-2011/PwgSecurity.wsdl>
  - b. <ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ids/wd/schema/12-2011/PwgSecurityOpMsg.xsd>
  - c. <ftp://ftp.pwg.org/pub/pwg/ids/wd/schema/12-2011/Security.xsd>
  - d. Need to separate the encryption and hash WKVs
  - e. May want to talk about negotiation policies/strategies for printers and clients (protocol negotiation, authentication, etc.)
  - f. Rolls:
    - end-user -> EndUser
    - Normal (P2600) vs. User (IPP/SM) vs. EndUser (IPP/SM)
      - Probably want to combine as just User
    - Add "Guest" or "Anonymous"?
      - Identity may be provided but no authentication
    - Add "AuthenticatedGuest"?
      - Authenticates but is a guest/visitor/contractor with less privileges than "User"
      - Need to clearly define it; do we just use GroupMember?
    - P2600 limits role definition to the kinds of things can be done
    - Change "JobOwner" to "Owner" (owner of object for the operation/policy)
    - Add "System" role?
    - Other Printer MIB Roles:
      - System Manager
      - Help Desk
      - Asset Manager
      - Accountant

## Next Steps / Open Actions

- Next conference call January 19, 2012 at 1pm Eastern Time
- Debate user roles
- Post updates of all documents
- Action: Mike to change template abstract to use the word "document" instead of "standard".